

**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday,  
11th May 2005, at 9.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Greffier of the States,  
Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye.**

All members were present with the exception of –

John Baudains Germain, Connétable of St. Martin– ill  
Celia Joyce Scott Warren, Deputy of St. Saviour– ill.

Prayers read by the Deputy Greffier of the States.

**Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES agreed to defer consideration of the following matter from the present meeting –

Commission Amicale: appointment of President and Chairman. P.89/2005.  
Lodged: 26th April 2005.  
*Policy and Resources Committee.*

**Arrangement of public business for the next meeting on 24th May 2005**

THE STATES confirmed that the following matter lodged “au Greffe” would be considered at the next meeting on 24th May 2005 –

Commission Amicale: appointment of President and Chairman. P.89/2005.  
Lodged: 26th April 2005.  
*Policy and Resources Committee.*

**Social Security Fund: removal of earnings limit – P.82/2005**

**Comments**

THE STATES resumed consideration of a proposition of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier concerning the Social Security Fund: removal of earnings limit, and, following consideration, adopted a proposition of the Connétable of St. Lawrence that, in accordance with Standing Order 26A(1), the question be now put.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 19**

Senator R.J. Shenton  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. John  
Deputy of Trinity

**CONTRE: 17**

Senator W. Kinnard  
Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.V.F. Le Claire  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator M.E. Vibert  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Senator E.P. Vibert  
Connétable of St. Lawrence

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy T.J. Le Main (H)  
Deputy M.F. Dubras (L)  
Deputy F.G. Voisin (L)  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
Deputy J.A. Bernstein (B)  
Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy M.A. Taylor (C)

Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy P.N. Troy (B)  
Deputy L.J. Farnham (S)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)

THE STATES rejected paragraph (a)(i) of the proposition requesting them to agree that, with effect from 1st January 2006, the earnings limit for employee contributions to the Social Security Fund should be removed.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 13**

Senator J.A. Le Maistre  
Senator S. Syvret  
Senator W. Kinnard  
Senator P.F.V. Le Claire  
Senator E.P. Vibert  
Senator R.J. Shenton  
Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy J.A. Bernstein (B)  
Deputy of Grouville

**CONTRE: 35**

Senator F.H. Walker  
Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator M.E. Vibert  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. John  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy T.J. Le Main (H)  
Deputy M.F. Dubras (L)  
Deputy J.L. Dorey (H)  
Deputy P.N. Troy (B)  
Deputy F.G. Voisin (L)  
Deputy L.J. Farnham (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J-A. Bridge (H)  
Deputy S.G. Ferguson (B)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)  
Deputy M.A. Taylor (C)  
Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected paragraph (a)(ii) of the proposition requesting them to agree that, with effect from 1st

January 2006, the earnings limit for employer contributions should be removed.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 9**

Senator J.A. Le Maistre  
Senator S. Syvret  
Senator W. Kinnard  
Senator P.V.F. Le Claire  
Senator E.P. Vibert  
Senator R.J. Shenton  
Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)

**CONTRE: 39**

Senator F.H. Walker  
Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator M.E. Vibert  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. John  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy T.J. Le Main (H)  
Deputy M.F. Dubras (L)  
Deputy J.L. Dorey (H)  
Deputy P.N. Troy (B)  
Deputy F.G. Voisin (L)  
Deputy L.J. Farnham (S)  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J-A. Bridge (H)  
Deputy J.A. Bernstein (B)  
Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)  
Deputy M.A. Taylor (C)  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

THE STATES rejected paragraph (a)(iii) of the proposition requesting them to agree that, with effect from 1s January 2006, the overall contribution rate should be increased from that date by 0.5% annually (made up of a 0.25% increase in the employer contribution and a 0.25% increase in the employee contribution), until the requirement for supplementation was eliminated.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 10**

Senator J.A. Le Maistre

**CONTRE: 38**

Senator F.H. Walker

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator S. Syvret  
Senator W. Kinnard  
Senator P.V.F. Le Claire  
Senator E.P. Vibert  
Senator R.J. Shenton  
Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy of Grouville

Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
Senator P.F. Routier  
Senator M.E. Vibert  
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of St. Brelade  
Connétable of St. Peter  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of Trinity  
Connétable of St. Lawrence  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. John  
Deputy of Trinity  
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy T.J. Le Main (H)  
Deputy M.F. Dubras (L)  
Deputy J.L. Dorey (H)  
Deputy P.N. Troy (B)  
Deputy F.G. Voisin (L)  
Deputy L.J. Farnham (S)  
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)  
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
Deputy J-A. Bridge (H)  
Deputy J.A. Bernstein (B)  
Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)  
Deputy M.A. Taylor (C)  
Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)

THE STATES noted that, subsequent to paragraphs (a)(i), (a)(ii) and (a)(iii) of the proposition being rejected paragraph (b) of the proposition requesting that the States charge the Employment and Social Security Committee, in conjunction with the Finance and Economics Committee, to bring forward for approval the necessary legislation to give effect to the proposal, was deemed to have been withdrawn.

### **Suspension of Standing Order 26(A)**

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of Deputy Lyndon John Farnham of St. Saviour, agreed that Standing Order 26(A) of the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey be suspended during consideration of the proposition of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier concerning Income Tax: additional liability, (P.81/2005 lodged “au Greffe” on 20th April 2005), and the proposition of the Finance and Economics Committee concerning the Fiscal Strategy, (P.44/2005 lodged “au Greffe” on 8th March 2005), and amendments.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 38**

**CONTRE: 10**

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Senator J.A. Le Maistre	Connétable of St. Clement
Senator S. Syvret	Connétable of Trinity
Senator F.H. Walker	Connétable of St. Lawrence
Senator W. Kinnard	Connétable of Grouville
Senator T.A. Le Sueur	Deputy of Trinity
Senator P.V.F. Le Claire	Deputy of St. John
Senator P.F. Routier	Deputy T.J. Le Main (H)
Senator M.E. Vibert	Deputy M.F. Dubras (L)
Senator P.F.C. Ozouf	Deputy J.L. Dorey (H)
Senator E.P. Vibert	Deputy F.G. Voisin (L)
Senator R.J. Shenton	
Connétable of St. Ouen	
Connétable of St. Saviour	
Connétable of St. Brelade	
Connétable of St. Peter	
Connétable of St. Helier	
Connétable of St. John	
Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)	
Deputy A. Breckon (S)	
Deputy J.J. Huet (H)	
Deputy of St. Martin	
Deputy P.N. Troy (B)	
Deputy L.J. Farnham (S)	
Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)	
Deputy J.B. Fox (H)	
Deputy J-A. Bridge (H)	
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)	
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)	
Deputy J.A. Bernstein (B)	
Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)	
Deputy of St. Mary	
Deputy of St. Ouen	
Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)	
Deputy M.A. Taylor (C)	
Deputy of Grouville	
Deputy of St. Peter	
Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)	
Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)	

### **Deputy Gerard Clifford Lemmens Baudains of St. Clement– attendance**

Deputy Gerard Clifford Lemmens Baudains of St. Clement arrived in the Chamber prior to the consideration of the proposition of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier concerning Income Tax: additional liability (P.81/2005 lodged “au Greffe” on 20th April 2005), and was present for the remainder of the meeting.

### **Income Tax: additional liability – P.81/2005**

#### **Comments**

THE STATES rejected a proposition of Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier requesting them to–

- (a) agree that the Income Tax (Jersey) Law 1961 should be amended to provide for the charging of an additional charge of income tax for a year of assessment, at the rate specified below, upon the amount of a person’s liability to tax for that year as follows –

- (1) for the year of assessment 2006, 0.87%;
- (2) for the year of assessment 2007, 1.75%; and
- (3) for the year of assessment 2008 and ensuing years, 2.65%.”; and,

(b) charge the Finance and Economics Committee to bring forward for approval the necessary legislation to give effect to the proposal.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 10**

Senator S. Syvret  
 Senator W. Kinnard  
 Senator P.V.F. Le Claire  
 Senator E.P. Vibert  
 Deputy A. Breckon (S)  
 Deputy G.C.L. Baudains (C)  
 Deputy P.N. Troy (B)  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy of Grouville

**CONTRE: 37**

Senator J.A. Le Maistre  
 Senator F.H. Walker  
 Senator T.A. Le Sueur  
 Senator P.F. Routier  
 Senator M.E. Vibert  
 Senator P.F.C. Ozouf  
 Senator R.J. Shenton  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Deputy of Trinity  
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)  
 Deputy J.J. Huet (H)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy T.J. Le Main (H)  
 Deputy M.F. Dubras (L)  
 Deputy J.L. Dorey (H)  
 Deputy F.G. Voisin (L)  
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisier (S)  
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)  
 Deputy J-A. Bridge (H)  
 Deputy J.A. Bernstein (B)  
 Deputy S.C. Ferguson (B)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy P.J.D. Ryan (H)  
 Deputy M.A. Taylor (C)  
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)  
 Deputy G.W.J. de Faye (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

**Fiscal Strategy – P.44/2005  
 Amendment and Comments**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of the Finance and Economics Committee concerning a Fiscal Strategy together with an amendment of Senator Stuart Syvret that, in paragraph (a)(i), after the final word there be added the following words –

“except that GST will not apply to –

- (a) basic foodstuffs,
- (b) children’s clothing,
- (c) medical services and products,
- (d) books and newspapers;”

### **Adjournment**

THE STATES then adjourned, having adopted a proposition of Senator Terence Augustine Le Sueur that consideration of the amendment of Senator Stuart Syvret to the proposition of the Finance and Economics Committee concerning a Fiscal Strategy, (P.44/2005 lodged “au Greffe” on 8th March 2005), together with all outstanding matters of public business, continue the next day, Thursday 12th May 2005, and the following day, Friday 13th May 2005, if necessary.

THE STATES rose at 5.35 p.m.

**A.H. HARRIS**

*Deputy Greffier of the States.*